

Message

**From:** Hurlid, Kathy [Hurlid.Kathy@epa.gov]  
**Sent:** 7/24/2018 4:16:08 PM  
**To:** 'simma.kupchan@gmail.com' [simma.kupchan@gmail.com]  
**CC:** Wade, Alexis [Wade.Alexis@epa.gov]  
**Subject:** I'd add FW: ACTION FW: Shellfish Follow-up

So I'd simply add to Rachel's statement below

**Ex. 5 AC/DP**

# Ex. 5 AC/DP

**From:** FertikEdgerton, Rachel  
**Sent:** Tuesday, July 24, 2018 10:53 AM  
**To:** Kaiser, Russell <Kaiser.Russell@epa.gov>; Kupchan, Simma <Kupchan.Simma@epa.gov>  
**Cc:** Hurlid, Kathy <Hurlid.Kathy@epa.gov>; Frazer, Brian <Frazer.Brian@epa.gov>; Goodin, John <Goodin.John@epa.gov>; McDavit, Michael W. <Mcdavit.Michael@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** RE: ACTION FW: Shellfish Follow-up

On further review, the 2<sup>nd</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> sentences cover the same ground. I prefer the second one as it is more precise, but you can make the call.

**From:** FertikEdgerton, Rachel  
**Sent:** Tuesday, July 24, 2018 10:48 AM  
**To:** Kaiser, Russell <Kaiser.Russell@epa.gov>; Kupchan, Simma <Kupchan.Simma@epa.gov>  
**Cc:** Hurlid, Kathy <Hurlid.Kathy@epa.gov>; Frazer, Brian <Frazer.Brian@epa.gov>; Goodin, John <Goodin.John@epa.gov>; McDavit, Michael W. <Mcdavit.Michael@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** RE: ACTION FW: Shellfish Follow-up

Here is some draft language for Simma and Alexis to review. Citations could be moved to footnotes for improved readability.

# Ex. 5 AC/DP

Thanks,

Rachel

**From:** Kaiser, Russell

**Sent:** Tuesday, July 24, 2018 9:11 AM

**To:** FertikEdgerton, Rachel <FertikEdgerton.Rachel@epa.gov>; Kupchan, Simma <Kupchan.Simma@epa.gov>

**Cc:** Hurlid, Kathy <Hurlid.Kathy@epa.gov>; Frazer, Brian <Frazer.Brian@epa.gov>; Goodin, John <Goodin.John@epa.gov>; McDavit, Michael W. <Mcdavit.Michael@epa.gov>

**Subject:** FW: ACTION FW: Shellfish Follow-up

Rachel,

I need you to work on the below task ASAP. Response can be brief. For example, two sentences. One Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

## Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Rachel – after we reach agreement on the language, pls insert as described below and forward to all parties. **Please note this is due today.**

Russell L. Kaiser

Chief, Freshwater and Marine Regulatory Branch

Oceans, Wetlands and Communities Division

Office of Wetlands, Oceans and Watersheds

1301 Constitution Ave., N.W.

Room 7114B West Bldg.

Washington, DC 20004

P: 202.566.0963

C: Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)

**From:** Goodin, John

**Sent:** Tuesday, July 24, 2018 8:26 AM

**To:** Frazer, Brian <Frazer.Brian@epa.gov>; Kaiser, Russell <Kaiser.Russell@epa.gov>

**Cc:** Connors, Sandra <Connors.Sandra@epa.gov>; McDavit, Michael W. <Mcdavit.Michael@epa.gov>

**Subject:** ACTION FW: Shellfish Follow-up

Morning, Folks--Need to do this today: Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

## Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Thanks  
John

---

**From:** Forsgren, Lee  
**Sent:** Tuesday, July 24, 2018 8:15 AM  
**To:** Goodin, John <[Goodin.John@epa.gov](mailto:Goodin.John@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** RE: Shellfish Follow-up

John,

Can you put in the ESA discussion and then I will get this to Chairman Graves.

Lee

---

**From:** Goodin, John  
**Sent:** Monday, July 23, 2018 2:56 PM  
**To:** Forsgren, Lee <[Forsgren.Lee@epa.gov](mailto:Forsgren.Lee@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** Shellfish Follow-up

Per discussion, see below.

## Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Sent from my iPhone

Begin forwarded message:

---

**From:** Goodin, John  
**Sent:** Tuesday, June 12, 2018 2:49 PM  
**To:** Forsgren, Lee <[Forsgren.Lee@epa.gov](mailto:Forsgren.Lee@epa.gov)>  
**Cc:** Campbell, Ann <[Campbell.Ann@epa.gov](mailto:Campbell.Ann@epa.gov)>; Frazer, Brian <[Frazer.Brian@epa.gov](mailto:Frazer.Brian@epa.gov)>; Russell Kaiser <[Kaiser.Russell@epa.gov](mailto:Kaiser.Russell@epa.gov)>; Sandra Connors (<[Connors.Sandra@epa.gov](mailto:Connors.Sandra@epa.gov)> <[Connors.Sandra@epa.gov](mailto:Connors.Sandra@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** Shellfish Follow-up

Lee—below is our coordinated response with OGC that addresses the questions below regarding

## Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Thanks,

-----

Question: do normal commercial shellfish farming activities usually result in discharges of dredged or fill material, as those terms are defined under Section 404 of the Clean Water Act?

Answer:

**Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)**

Question: To the extent any shellfish farming activities do involve regulated discharges of dredged or fill material, is the Clean Water Act Section 404(f)(1)(A) exemption applicable to shellfish farming, including seeding, cultivation, and harvesting activities?

Answer:

**Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)**

# Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

**From:** "Forsgren, Lee" <[Forsgren.Lee@epa.gov](mailto:Forsgren.Lee@epa.gov)>  
**Date:** June 5, 2018 at 10:12:11 PM EDT  
**To:** "Bennitt, Ian" <[Ian.Bennitt@mail.house.gov](mailto:Ian.Bennitt@mail.house.gov)>  
**Cc:** "Goodin, John" <[Goodin.John@epa.gov](mailto:Goodin.John@epa.gov)>, "Ross, David P" <[ross.davidp@epa.gov](mailto:ross.davidp@epa.gov)>, "Ringel, Aaron" <[ringel.aaron@epa.gov](mailto:ringel.aaron@epa.gov)>, "Lyons, Troy" <[lyons.troy@epa.gov](mailto:lyons.troy@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** Re: Shellfish

Ian,

Let me do some checking and get back to you ASAP.

Lee

Sent from my iPhone

On Jun 5, 2018, at 9:19 PM, Bennitt, Ian <[Ian.Bennitt@mail.house.gov](mailto:Ian.Bennitt@mail.house.gov)> wrote:

Lee – following up. Can we request some TA from yall with regard to our shellfish issue. Specifically, we would like to know whether EPA concurs with the Army Corps of Engineers' position, as stated in the March 2016 draft preamble to the 2017 Nationwide Permit 48, regarding the applicability of Section 404 of the Clean Water Act to commercial shellfish farming activities, including:

- i. That normal commercial shellfish farming activities usually do not result in discharges of dredged or fill material, as those

terms are defined under Section 404 of the Clean Water Act;  
and

- ii. That, to the extent any shellfish farming activities do involve regulated discharges of dredged or fill material, the Clean Water Act Section 404(f)(1)(A) exemption is applicable to shellfish farming, including seeding, cultivation, and harvesting activities.

Thanks for your help,

**Ian H. Bennitt**

Staff Director, Water Resources and Environment Subcommittee

Committee on Transportation and Infrastructure

202-225-4360

***This email and any related communications, documents, notes, draft legislation, recommendations, reports, or other materials generated or received by the Members or staff of the U.S. House of Representatives Committee on Transportation and Infrastructure are congressional records and remain subject to the Committee's control, and are entrusted to your agency only for use in handling this matter. Any such documents created or compiled by an agency in connection with any response to this Committee document or any related Committee communications, whether made by phone, email, or document, including any replies to the Committee, are also records of the Committee and remain subject to the Committee's control. Accordingly, the aforementioned documents are not "agency records" for purposes of the Freedom of Information Act or any other law, and should be segregated from agency records.***